# Viscoelastic Properties of Poly(ethylene-*co*-styrene) Copolymers

### A. LOBBRECHT,<sup>1</sup> CHR. FRIEDRICH,<sup>2</sup> F. G. SERNETZ,<sup>2</sup> R. MÜLHAUPT<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> CNRS-Laboratoire de Chemie et Procedes de Polymerisation, BP 24, F-69390 Vernaison, France

<sup>2</sup> Institut für Makromolekulare Chemie und Freiburger Materialforschungszentrum (FMF), Universität Freiburg i. Br., Stefan-Meier-Str. 21, 79104 Freiburg, Germany

Received 29 July 1996; accepted 5 January 1997

ABSTRACT: The viscoelastic properties of narrowly distributed linear poly(ethylene-costyrene) copolymers with different mole fractions of styrene ( $x_s = 0-20.5 \text{ mol } \%$ ) and molecular weights  $(M_w = 64 - 214 \text{ kg/mol})$  were analyzed in the molten state at different temperatures by means of oscillatory rheometry. Analyzing the thermorheological properties of the polymers, we found that the time temperature superposition principle is fulfilled. The corresponding shift factors follow up to 16.5 mol % of styrene units the Arrhenius behavior of neat polyethylene. For a styrene content of about 20 mol %, the polymers no longer crystallize and a transition from Arrhenius to WLF behavior of pure polystyrene was observed. The zero shear viscosity,  $\eta_0$ , of the polymers was derived from the mastercurves. The determination of the plateau modulus by the well-known  $\tan \delta$ -min criterion is not possible due to the beginning crystallization in the corresponding temperature range. An approximate calculation of this value is based on the characteristic relaxation time  $\lambda_x = 1/\omega_x$ , corresponding to the crossover of G' and G". Indeed, the characteristic modulus  $G_{px}$  calculated as  $\eta_0/\lambda_x$  is a good approximation for the plateau modulus  $G_p$ . The viscosity-molecular weight and relaxation time-molecular weight scaling relations were established for three copolymers with different molecular weights and nearly the same styrene content. For both material parameters, the scaling exponent is around 3.4, confirming the linear architecture of the investigated polymers. The mixing rules describing the change of such material parameters like zero shear viscosity or plateau modulus independent of styrene content are of logarithmic linear character using the weight fraction of styrene units instead of the mole fraction. The relations found allow the prediction of melt state properties for polymers with arbitrary styrene content. In the future, when catalysts with sufficient activity for the synthesis of high styrene content copolymers are available, these predictions will have to be checked. © 1997 John Wiley & Sons, Inc. J Appl Polym Sci 65: 209-215, 1997

**Key words:** copolymers; poly(ethylene-*co*-styrene); viscoelasticity; material parameters; mixing rules

# INTRODUCTION

The rheology of polymer blends and block copolymers has attracted much attention for a couple of years. However, little is known concerning the behavior of random ethene/styrene copolymers. This situation is a consequence of the difficulty residing in the synthesis of poly(ethene-*co*-styrene). The problems occurring in the copolymerizations of olefins with styrene by conventional Ziegler-Natta catalysts have been reported by several authors since 1964.<sup>1-4</sup> Indeed, for a vinyl aro-

Correspondence to: Chr. Friedrich.

<sup>© 1997</sup> John Wiley & Sons, Inc. CCC 0021-8995/97/020209-07

matic comonomer such as styrene, only a maximum of about 1 mol % styrene units in the copolymer was reached in the past. The polymers reported often comprise a mixture of homopolymers and copolymers.<sup>2,4</sup>

Recently, as reported in the specific trade and patent literature,<sup>5,6</sup> the synthesis of Mono-Cp-amido-complexes<sup>7-9</sup> was the base for the new metallocene catalyst generation, which produces poly-(ethylene-co-styrene) containing over 30 mol % styrene. Up to now, only a few articles<sup>10-12</sup> concerning the characterization of poly(ethylene-costyrene) were available. The systematic structure/property correlation of this new material has to be established. The influence of polymerization conditions on the copolymerization and the effect of styrene content in the copolymer on its thermal properties have already been published.<sup>11,12</sup> The influence of styrene content on mechanical properties as measured in a tensile experiment was also investigated.<sup>12</sup> It was found that the high styrene copolymers exhibit stress relaxation behavior comparable to that of flexible poly(vinyl chloride), which is known for its unique relaxation response.

Here, we present a study of the rheological properties of these new copolymers. Using dynamic rheology on a series of linear random ethylene/styrene copolymers containing different contents of styrene units and having different molecular weights, the relationship between material parameters like zero shear viscosity and structural characteristics like molecular weight and styrene content is examined.

# **EXPERIMENTAL**

# **Polymer Synthesis**

The copolymers were synthesized with Me<sub>2</sub>Si-(Me<sub>4</sub>Cp)(N-*tert*-butyl)TiCl<sub>2</sub>/MAO (Me, methyl; Cp, cyclopentadienyl; MAO, methylalumoxane); the catalyst was synthesized according to the literature.<sup>11</sup> Copolymerizations were carried out in a 500-mL glass autoclave. The reactor was fed with toluene, styrene, and part of the MAO needed. After thermostating the reactor, argon was removed via vacuum and the reaction mixture was saturated with ethene. The metallocene solution (in 10 wt % MAO solution) was then injected into the reactor. The catalyst concentration was 20  $\mu$ mol/L, and the Al : Ti ratio was 2,000. Further polymerization conditions were described earlier.<sup>11</sup> Copolymerizations were stopped by injecting  $C_3H_7OH$  and venting off excess ethene. The copolymers were precipitated by being poured into acidic CH<sub>3</sub>OH, filtered, and dried under vacuum to constant weight.

## **Polymer Analysis**

To determine the mole percentage of styrene in the copolymers,  $x_S$ , nuclear magnetic resonance spectra were recorded on a Bruker ARX 300 spectrometer operating at 300 MHz for <sup>1</sup>H and at 75.4 MHz for <sup>13</sup>C. Spectra were taken at 100°C with  $C_2D_2Cl_4$  as solvent. The solvent peak ( $C_2HDCl_4$ ) was calibrated to 74.06 ppm in the <sup>13</sup>C spectra. Molecular weights and molecular weight distributions were determined by gel permeation chromatography versus polyethylene standard. Molecular weight distributions, characterized by the ratio of the weight average to the number average molecular weight,  $M_w/M_n$ , were found in the range of 2.3-2.9. All of these data are presented in Table I. From Table I, it can be seen that the styrene content is not uniformly distributed and does not exceed 21 mol %. This is a consequence of the fact that at the moment the synthesis of these new copolymers is difficult and we are far from "tailor-making" these materials. Nevertheless, the investigations allow a first insight in the structure property relationships of these new polymers.

For the discussion of rheological properties, thermal properties like the melting temperature,  $T_m$ , and the glass transition temperature,  $T_g$ , are also of importance. These data were determined by differential scanning calorimetry and dynamic mechanical analysis and were reported in a previous communication.<sup>11</sup> Here, we present these results for all determined characteristic temperatures in Figure 1 where the weight fraction of styrene in the copolymers,  $w_s$ , is used as the abscissa. The polymers to be considered here are indicated in this figure by arrows and the sample name.

For the rheological investigations to be presented here, the polymers are subdivided into three groups. The first group comprises the copolymers S34, S35, and S36, which have nearly the same styrene content of about  $x_s \approx 3.5 \text{ mol } \%$  and different molecular weights. These polymers are used to establish the viscosity-molecular weight relationship. The second and third groups comprise polymers having molecular weights in the range of polystyrene ( $M_w = 71,000 \text{ g/mol: S34}$ ,

Sample	Styrene Content $x_s$ (mol %)	$egin{array}{c} { m Styrene} \\ { m Content} \\ w_s \\ ({ m weight}\ \%) \end{array}$	$M_w$ $10^{-3}$ (g/mol)	$M_{w}/M_{n}$	$\eta_0$ Pas	$\lambda_x$ sec	$10^{-5}\ G_{px}$ Pa
S34	3.4	11.6	64	2.8	3,400	0.002	17.0
S35	3.5	11.9	178	2.3	133,000	0.063	21.1
S36	3.6	12.2	76.5	2.5	9,000	0.004	22.5
S165	16.5	42.3	122	2.6	58,000	0.04	14.5
S203	20.3	48.6	214	2.9	634,000	0.4	15.8
$\mathbf{PS}$	100	100	17	1.05	305,000	1.58	1.9

Table I Molecular and Rheological Data of the Polymers Used

S36, and S165) or in the range of polyethylene  $(M_w = 190,000 \text{ g/mol: S35} \text{ and S203})$ , regardless of the styrene content. The molecular weights of the homopolymers serve as reference states,  $M_w^{ref1}$  and  $M_w^{ref2}$ , respectively.

#### Sample Preparation and Rheology

To permit the rheological measurements, a stabilizer blend containing 0.2 wt % of a phosphite antioxidant (IRGAFOS 168, Ciba-Geigy AG) and 0.1% of a phenolic antioxidant (IRGANOX 1076,



**Figure 1** Glass transition temperatures and melting temperatures as a function of the weight content of styrene units in the copolymer. The line through the melting temperatures is to guide the eye, whereas the line in the case of  $T_g$  represents a fit using the Gordon-Taylor equation with K = 0.144. The arrows indicate the location of the polymers under investigation on the abscissa.

Ciba-Geigy AG) was used. The stabilizers were solved in 1 mL of acetone and mixed to the copolymer powder. Finally, samples were held under vacuum at 100°C. The stabilized copolymers were then compression molded at 140°C (respectively at 165°C for pure polyethylene) in the form of 1mm-thick plates having a diameter of 25 mm. The reference polyethylene and polystyrene were also stabilized in order to optimize the comparison with the copolymers.

The rheological properties of the polymers were characterized by dynamic mechanical measurements with a Rheometrics Mechanical Spectrometer RMS 800 operating with parallel plate geometry. The samples were held under nitrogen atmosphere in order to avoid thermooxidative degradation. The shear storage modulus G' and the shear loss modulus G'' were determined over a shear rate range from 0.01 to 100 rad/sec in a temperature interval ranging from 120 to 200°C. The isotherms were shifted to mastercurves at a reference temperature  $T_0 = 140$ °C using the program LSSHIFT.<sup>13</sup>

# **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### Shift Factors and Mastercurves

The temperature dependence of the horizontal shift factors  $a_T$  is presented in Figure 2 for all copolymers as well as for the polyethylene and polystyrene references. Here, the shift factors of the copolymers up to 16.5 mol % styrene are very similar to these of polyethylene and fall within the hatched area presented in this figure. Moreover, the low absolute values for  $a_T$  obtained for the copolymers indicate that, in contrast to many homopolymer melts like polystyrene and poly-



**Figure 2** Temperature dependence of the horizontal shift factor log  $a_T$  for the copolymers and for the polyethylene and polystyrene references. The hatched area covers the shift factors for copolymers with up to 16.5 mol % styrene units. The dotted line connects the points for the sample with 20.3 mol % styrene. The solid line represents the WLF behavior of polystyrene.

methylmetacrylate, their rheology is hardly temperature dependent. Figure 2 also shows that due to the linear relationship of  $a_T$  versus 1/T, the rheological behavior of such polymers can be described by the empirical Arrhenius equation. Such a behavior is consistent with results found on pure PE<sup>14</sup> or PP.<sup>15</sup> As a conclusion, it has to be noticed that the shift behavior of the copolymers with styrene content up to 16.5 mol % is identical to that of pure polyethylene.

A systematic deviation from this behavior starts with copolymer S203 containing 20.3 mol % styrene. The slope of the line connecting the shift factors of that polymer is different from those with smaller  $x_s$  values. This onset in changing the shift properties from Arrhenius-like behavior for the polyethylene and polyethylene-like copolymers to the WLF behavior of pure polystyrene corresponds to the disappearance of crystallinity. This can be seen in Figure 1, where for this copolymer, no melting was observed. Copolymers with higher styrene content are not available at the moment because increasing styrene concentration rapidly reduces the catalyst activity. This is the reason why it is not possible to analyze this transition quantitatively by the help of the shift factors. Nevertheless, we have a clear qualitative picture which shows that the shiftability of isotherms is mainly that of polyethylene for those copolymers which are able to crystallize. With the loss of that ability, the transition from polyethylene-like behavior to the shift behavior of pure polystyrene begins.

Figure 3 depicts the master curves of polymers with a molecular weight of about 190 kg/mol. What we observe is the rheological response of polymers with a polydispersity far from that of polymers prepared by living polymerization: a broad transitional region. The plateau zone is not reached at the highest frequencies as well as the terminal zone for the lowest frequencies. Although the terminal region is not finally reached because G' shows a significant deviation from the proportionality to  $\omega^2$ , it is already possible to determine the zero shear viscosity,  $\eta_0$ . The limiting behavior of G'' proportional to  $\omega$  corresponds to the formation of a viscosity plateau for the dynamic viscosity  $\eta' = G''/\omega$ . For those polymers for which the viscosity plateau was also not reached,  $\eta'$  values corresponding to the last measured G''value have been taken into account. The found



**Figure 3** Comparison of the mastercurves of the samples PE, S35, and S203 at the reference temperature  $T_0 = 140^{\circ}$ C. The storage modulus and the loss modulus have been measured over a shear rate range from 0.01 to 100 rad/sec for temperatures between 120 and 200°C. For the samples PE and S203, the mastercurves have been shifted one decade upward and downward, respectively.

values were cross-checked with  $\eta_0$  values obtained from the extrapolation procedure known from the Cole-Cole plot.

Because both the plateau and the terminal zones could not be reached, consequently, the determination of the terminal relaxation time  $\lambda_0$ and the plateau modulus  $G_p$  was not possible. However, the cross-point, defined as the point where G' and G'' are equal, can be evaluated. It was shown earlier that the coordinates of this cross-point were related to molecular parameters.<sup>15</sup> The time  $\lambda_x = 1/\omega_x$ , where  $\omega_x$  is the abscissa of the cross-point, has been estimated for each sample (see Table I) and can be considered as an approximation for the terminal relaxation time, as Dumoulin and Utracki<sup>17</sup> have already done for polyethylene blends. Furthermore, we will use this characteristic time to determine an approximation of the plateau modulus,  $G_{px}$ , using the following formula:

$$G_{px} = \frac{\eta_0}{\lambda_x} \tag{1}$$

Although  $\lambda_x$  is not the terminal relaxation time, interesting results have been deduced from this approximation, and moreover, the values found for the polyethylene and polystyrene references  $(G_{px}^{PE} = 32.8 \ 10^5 \text{ Pa} \text{ and } G_{px}^{PS} = 1.9 \ 10^5 \text{ Pa})$  were also consistent with the plateau moduli referred to in the literature.<sup>18,19</sup> The  $G_{px}$  values are also given in Table I.

By comparing master curves of samples with increasing styrene content, as presented in Figure 4, we notice that the cross-point is regularly shifted to smaller frequencies; this corresponds to increasing relaxation times. This shift is a consequence of the transition of a low  $T_g$  flexible polymer that possesses high molecular mobility of chain segments at the reference temperature to a high  $T_g$  polymer, which is less flexible and therefore relaxes slower.

#### Viscosity-Molecular Weight Relationship

Above a critical molecular weight,  $M_c (M_c^{PE} \approx 3,800 \text{ g/mol}^{18}, M_c^{PS} \approx 31,200 \text{ g/mol}^{18})$ , the empirical scaling relation for the zero shear viscosity,  $\eta_0$ , is the following:

$$\eta_0 \propto M_w^\alpha \tag{2}$$

An exponent of  $\alpha = 3.40$  is usually found for many



**Figure 4** Dependence of the zero shear viscosity,  $\eta_0$ , and the characteristic relaxation time,  $\lambda_x$ , on the weight average molecular weight,  $M_w$ , on a logarithmic scale for three copolymers containing about 3.5 mol % styrene units.

monodisperse polymers, but branching of the chains has a great influence on this value and long chain branching polymers exhibit a significant deviation from this scaling relation. To check this relationship for the polymers under investigation, the viscosities of copolymers of the first group are plotted in logarithmic scales versus molecular weight and the result is presented in Figure 4. In our case, the exponent is equal to  $\alpha$ = 3.34, showing that the copolymers follow the empirical scaling relation usually exhibited by the homopolymers and confirming the fact that these copolymers have a linear structure without any long chain branching known for "substantially linear olefin polymers."<sup>22</sup> Moreover, as will be shown below, this relation will permit us to deduce from a measured zero shear viscosity for fixed styrene content and molecular weight the corresponding  $\eta_0$  value for the same styrene content but the reference molecular weights  $M_w^{ref}$ .

Figure 4 also shows the characteristic times  $\lambda_x$  displaying the same scaling relation as that for the viscosity. In this case, the exponent is  $\alpha = 3.46$ . This fact supports the idea that the moduli calculated by eq. (1) are good approximations for the molecular weight-independent plateau modulus.

## Dependence of Material Parameters on the Styrene Content

Now, we analyze the dependence of material parameters like zero shear viscosity and approxi-



**Figure 5** Variation of the zero shear viscosity,  $\eta_0$ , versus the styrene content for two groups of copolymers with, respectively,  $M_w^{ref2} \approx 71$  kg/mol and  $M_w^{ref1} \approx 190$  kg/mol. The broken lines depict linear regressions using the mole content  $x_S$ ; the solid lines represent logarithmic linear mixing rules.

mate plateau modulus,  $G_{px}$ , on styrene content. To eliminate the influence of molecular weight, the viscosities of copolymers are corrected to the reference molecular weights of both groups. Additionally, we calculated the viscosities of the homopolymers for molecular weights corresponding to the reference of the other group.

Figure 5 depicts the dependence of the zero shear viscosity versus the styrene content for the two groups of copolymers having  $M_w^{ref1} = 71$  kg/mol (open symbols) and  $M_w^{ref2} = 190$  kg/mol (closed symbols) reference molecular weights, respectively. The styrene content is given as the weight percentage  $(w_S, \text{ circles})$  and the mole percentage  $(x_{\rm S}, {\rm triangles})$ . The lines connecting the viscosities of both homopolymers represent the logarithmic linear mixing rule for the mole content or the weight content of styrene, respectively. The zero shear viscosity regularly increases with increasing styrene content, at least for the styrene content interval studied in this article. As is apparent from Figure 5, for both groups of polymers, we find that the dependence on weight content styrene seems to lie on a straight line, representing the logarithmic linear mixing rule:

$$\log \eta_{0CP} = w_S \log \eta_{0S} + w_E \log \eta_{0E}$$
 (3)

 $\eta_{0CP}$  is the zero shear viscosity of the copolymer, and the subscripts indicate the values for pure polystyrene and polyethylene, respectively. The weight percentage of ethylene units is given by  $w_E$ . The dependence on  $x_S$  is rather nonlinear with a positive deviating tendency, as indicated by the broken lines. These lines represent a linear regression and are drawn to guide the eye. The  $x_S$ values are not spread wide enough to establish a nonlinear dependence.

Now, we evaluate the approximate value of the plateau modulus,  $G_{px}$ , as determined by eq. (1), on the styrene content for all copolymers, no matter to which group these polymers belong. Besides the fact we mentioned, this is possible because all molecular weights (with the exception of polystyrene) under consideration are above the critical molecular weight  $M'_c$  calculated for the copolymers using the linear mixing rule  $M'_c = w_s M'_c^{PS}$ +  $w_E M_c'^{PE}$ , the empirical rule  $M_c' \approx 6 M_e$ , and the following values for the entanglement molecular weights of homopolymers:  $M_e^{PE} \approx 1,300$  g/mol and  $M_e^{PS} \approx 18,000$  g/mol.<sup>18</sup> Here,  $M_c'$  is used instead of  $M_c$  because the plateau modulus changes its dependence on molecular weight at higher molecular weights than the viscosity and we are on the safe side. As is apparent from Figure 6, the approximated plateau modulus  $G_{px}$  decreases regularly with increasing styrene content, at least



**Figure 6** Variation of the approximated plateau modulus  $G_{px}$  versus the styrene content. The broken line depicts linear regressions using the mole content  $x_S$ ; the solid line represents the logarithmic linear mixing rule.

for the styrene content interval studied in this article. The linear mixing rule for the logarithm of the moduli based on the weight percentage of styrene in the copolymer seems to be appropriate for describing the modulus-styrene content relationship quantitatively. The points based on the  $x_s$  presentation all lie below the straight line. Such a mixing rule

$$\log G_{pxCP} = w_S \log G_{pxS} + w_E \log G_{pxE} \quad (4)$$

was recently found by Wu and Beckerbauer<sup>20</sup> for other statistical copolymers. They used the volume percentage instead of the weight percentage in their equation. The calculation of the volume percentage by using the atomic volumes of the species, as listed by van Krevelen<sup>21</sup> ( $V_{0S} = 99 \text{ cm}^3$ / mol,  $V_{0E} = 33 \text{ cm}^3/\text{mol}$ ), shows that there is no significant difference, and it is hard to decide which presentation is more correct. Nevertheless, it is possible to elucidate the entanglement behavior of the copolymers using eq. (3). The higher the number of styrene units, the fewer the entanglements between the chains. Also, the longer the spacing between entanglements, the greater  $M_e$ becomes.

#### CONCLUSIONS

The investigated copolymers show an interesting thermorheological transition from Arrhenius behavior for copolymers with styrene contents up to 16.5 mol % to WLF behavior for polymers with higher styrene contents. At the transition point, the change of type is associated with the loss of the crystallization ability of the copolymers. Whereas the zero shear viscosities are derived directly from the mastercurves, the plateau moduli are determined by means of the viscosity and the cross-point relaxation time. This method presented for the calculation of the plateau modulus is appropriate for the polymers used. The range of applicability has to be checked for other polymers in the future. The established mixing rules support the idea of logarithmically based linear mixing rules using the weight or volume fractions of styrene. The rheological properties found indicate that the synthesized polymers indeed are linear.

The authors thank the European Community (OPTMO

network, project no. CHRX-CT93-0158) and the BASF AG for supporting this research. F. G. Sernetz is grateful for a fellowship by the Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes.

## REFERENCES

- S. Kobayashi and A. Nishioka, J. Polym. Sci. Part A, 2, 3009 (1964).
- K. Soga, D. Lee, and H. Yanagihara, *Polym. Bull.*, 20, 237 (1988).
- R. Mani and C. M. Burns, *Macromolecules*, 24, 5476 (1991).
- Z. Lu, K. Liao, and S. Liu, J. Appl. Polym. Sci., 53, 1453 (1994).
- EP 0416 815 A2, The Dow Chemical Company, J. C. Stevens, F. J. Trimmers, D. R. Wilson, G. F. Schmidt, P. N. Nickias, R. K. Rosen, G. W. Knight, S. Lai (1990).
- EP 0514 828 A1, The Dow Chemical Company, D. D. Devore (1992).
- 7. P. J. Shapiro, E. Bunel, W. P. Schaefer, and J. E. Bercaw, *Organometallics*, **9**, 867 (1990).
- P. J. Shapiro, W. D. Cotter, W. P. Schaefer, J. A. Labinger, and J. E. Bercaw, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 116, 4623 (1994).
- 9. J. Okuda, Chem. Ber., 123, 1649 (1990).
- J. Ren and G. R. Hatfield, *Macromolecules*, 28, 2588 (1995).
- 11. F. G. Sernetz, R. Mülhaupt, and R. M. Waymouth, *Macromol. Chem. Phys.*, **197**, 1071 (1996).
- Y. W. Cheung and M. J. Guest, SPE Technical Papers, II, 1634 (1996).
- J. Honerkamp and J. Weese, *Rheol. Acta*, **32**, 57 (1993).
- H. Mavridis and R. N. Shroff, *Polym. Eng. Sci.*, 32, 1778 (1992).
- 15. A. Eckstein, Chr. Friedrich, A. Lobbrecht, R. Spitz, and R. Mülhaupt, *Acta Polym.*, **48**, 47 (1997).
- G. R. Zeichner and P. D. Patel, Proc. 2nd World Cong. Chem. Eng., 6, 333 (1981).
- M. M. Dumoulin and L. A. Utracki, in *Two-Phase Polymer Systems*, L. A. Utracki, Ed., Hanser Publishers, München, 1991.
- E.-J. Donth, Relaxation and Thermodynamics in Polymers, Akademie Verlag, Berlin, 1992.
- 19. J. D. Ferry, Viscoelastic Properties of Polymers, Wiley & Sons, New York, 1980.
- S. Wu and R. Beckerbauer, *Polymer*, 33, 509-515 (1992).
- 21. D. W. van Krevelen, Properties of Polymers: Their Estimation and Correlation with Chemical Structure, Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1972.
- WO 93/08221, The Dow Chemical Company, S.-Y. Lai, J. R. Wilson, G. W. Knight, and J. C. Stevens, 1993.